

Kybernetika

M. A. Mirzakhmedov; Sh. A. Chashimov

On some properties of estimators of a probability density

Kybernetika, Vol. 9 (1973), No. 4, (242)--250

Persistent URL: <http://dml.cz/dmlcz/125387>

Terms of use:

© Institute of Information Theory and Automation AS CR, 1973

Institute of Mathematics of the Academy of Sciences of the Czech Republic provides access to digitized documents strictly for personal use. Each copy of any part of this document must contain these *Terms of use*.



This paper has been digitized, optimized for electronic delivery and stamped with digital signature within the project *DML-CZ: The Czech Digital Mathematics Library*
<http://project.dml.cz>

On some Properties of Estimators of a Probability Density

M. A. MIRZACHMEDOV, SH. A. CHASHIMOV

Let X_1, X_2, \dots, X_n be mutually independent and identically distributed s -dimensional random vectors with a probability density $p(x) \in L_2$.

Consider the class of estimators $\hat{p}_n(x)$ of the form

$$\hat{p}_n(x) = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{k=1}^n p_n(x - X_k)$$

for estimating of the density $p(x)$, where $p_n(x) \in L_2$. In this paper some consistency properties of estimators in the sense of mean integral square error are studied.

1. INTRODUCTION

Let

$$X_k = (X_{k1}, \dots, X_{ks}), \quad k = 1, 2, \dots, n,$$

be a random sample with a sample size n from a distribution $F(x)$, $x \in R^s$, with the probability density $p(x) \in L_2$, i.e. X_1, \dots, X_n are mutually independent and identically distributed s -dimensional random vectors with the density $p(x) \in L_2(R^s)$.

Consider the class of estimators $p_n(x)$ of the form

$$\hat{p}_n(x) = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{k=1}^n p_n(x - X_k)$$

for estimating of the density $p(x)$, where $p_n(x) \in L_2$. The quality of the estimators is defined by the mean integral square error (MISE)

$$I_n = E \int_{R^s} [\hat{p}_n(x) - p(x)]^2 dx.$$

Let

$$f_1(t) = \int_{R^s} e^{i(t,x)} p(x) dx, \quad f_2(t) = \int_{R^s} e^{i(t,x)} \hat{p}_n(x) dx,$$

$$f_3(t) = \int_{R^s} e^{i(t,x)} p_n(x) dx,$$

where $(t, x) = \sum_{k=1}^s t_k \cdot x_k$ is the inner product of two elements t and x of R^s .

It is proved in [1] and [2] that

$$(1) \quad I_n = \frac{1}{(2\pi)^s} \int_{R^s} \left\{ \frac{1}{n} |f_3(t)|^2 \cdot [1 - |f_1(t)|^2] + |f_1(t)|^2 \cdot [1 - f_3(t)]^2 \right\} dt$$

and if

$$f_3(t) = f_3^*(t) = \frac{n|f_1(t)|^2}{1 + (n-1)|f_1(t)|^2},$$

$$f_3^*(t) = \int_{R^s} e^{i(t,x)} p_n^*(x) dx,$$

where

$$p_n^*(x) = \frac{1}{(2\pi)^s} \int_{R^s} e^{-i(t,x)} f_3^*(t) dt,$$

then the minimum of I_n is reached and

$$(2) \quad I_n^* = \min I_n = \frac{p_n^*(0, 0, \dots, 0)}{n} = O\left(\frac{1}{n}\right).$$

2. ASYMPTOTIC BEHAVIOUR OF I_n^*

For the sake of simplicity only the bivariate case is considered and asymptotic behaviour (if $n \rightarrow \infty$) of I_n^* is studied.

We say (see [3]), that the characteristic function $f_1(t)$ decreases exponentially with respect to coefficients $p_i > 0$ and with respect to t_i ($i = 1, 2$) if the following conditions are satisfied:

(a) $|f_1(t)| \leq A e^{-(p, |t|)}$, for some constant $A > 0$ and for all t ,

(b) $\lim_{v_1 \rightarrow \infty} \int_0^1 \int_0^1 [1 + e^{(p, v)} \cdot |f_1(v_1 t_1, v_2 t_2)|^2]^{-1} dt = 0$,

where

$$(p, |t|) = p_1 \cdot |t_1| + p_2 \cdot |t_2|, \quad (p, v) = p_1 v_1 + p_2 v_2.$$

244 The case when the characteristic function $f_1(t)$ decreases algebraically of degree $p_i > 0$ with respect to arguments t_i ($i = 1, 2$) was considered in [1], [2].

Definition. Let $\varphi(n)$ be some function of n and let $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \varphi(n) = \infty$. The estimator $\hat{p}_n(x)$ is said to be *integrally consistent of order* $\varphi(n)$ if

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \varphi(n) \cdot I_n = a \quad \text{where } 0 < a < \infty$$

(see [4]).

Theorem 1. Let the characteristic function $f_1(t)$ decrease exponentially with respect to coefficients $p_i > 0$ and arguments t_i ($i = 1, 2$). Then the estimator $\hat{p}_n^*(x)$ is integrally consistent of order $n/\ln^2 n$, namely:

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{n}{\ln^2 n} \cdot I_n^* = \frac{1}{8\pi^2 p_1 p_2}.$$

Proof.

$$\begin{aligned} & \int_{R^2} \frac{|f_1(t)|^2}{1 + (n-1)|f_1(t)|^2} dt - \int_{R^2} \frac{\exp[-2(p, |t|)]}{1 + (n-1)\exp[-2(p, |t|)]} dt = \\ & = \int_{R^2} \frac{|f_1(t)|^2 - \exp[-2(p, |t|)]}{[1 + (n-1)|f_1(t)|^2][1 + (n-1)\exp[-2(p, |t|)]]} dt = L. \end{aligned}$$

Denote

$$v_1 = \frac{\ln(n-1)}{2p_1}, \quad v_2 = \frac{\ln(n-1)}{2p_2}.$$

Using the condition (a), we have

$$\begin{aligned} |L| & \leq 4(A^2 + 1) \int_0^\infty \int_0^\infty \frac{\exp[-2(p, t)] dt_1 dt_2}{[1 + (n-1)|f_1(t)|^2][1 + (n-1)\exp[-2(p, t)]]} \leq \\ & \leq 4(A^2 + 1) \left\{ \int_0^{v_1} \int_0^{v_2} \frac{dt_1 dt_2}{(n-1)[1 + (n-1)|f_1(t)|^2]} + \right. \\ & \left. + \int_{v_1}^\infty \int_{v_2}^\infty e^{-2(p, t)} dt_1 dt_2 + \int_0^{v_1} \int_{v_2}^\infty e^{-2(p, t)} dt_1 dt_2 + \int_{v_1}^\infty \int_0^{v_2} e^{-2(p, t)} dt_1 dt_2 \right\} = L_1. \end{aligned}$$

Then, denoting

$$t_1 = v_1 s_1, \quad t_2 = v_2 s_2,$$

$$\begin{aligned}
L_1 &= 4(A^2 + 1) \left\{ \frac{1}{n-1} \int_0^1 \int_0^1 \frac{v_1 v_2 \, ds_1 \, ds_2}{1 + \exp[(p, v)] \cdot |f_1(v_1 s_1, v_2, s_2)|^2} + \right. \\
&\quad + \int_1^\infty \int_1^\infty v_1 v_2 e^{-2(p, vs)} \, ds_1 \, ds_2 + \int_0^1 \int_1^\infty v_1 v_2 e^{-2(p, vs)} \, ds_1 \, ds_2 + \\
&\quad \left. + \int_1^\infty \int_0^1 v_1 v_2 e^{-2(p, vs)} \, ds_1 \, ds_2 \right\} = \\
&= 4(A^2 + 1) \left\{ \frac{\ln^2(n-1)}{4p_1 p_2(n-1)} \int_0^1 \int_0^1 \frac{ds_1 \, ds_2}{1 + \exp[(p, v)] \cdot |f_1(v_1 s_1, v_2 s_2)|^2} + \right. \\
&\quad \left. + \frac{1}{2p_1 p_2(n-1)} - \frac{1}{4p_1 p_2(n-1)^2} \right\}.
\end{aligned}$$

Therefore, $L \rightarrow 0$ if $n \rightarrow \infty$.

Let us consider the following integral

$$\begin{aligned}
K_n &= \int_{R^2} \frac{\exp[-2(p, |t|)]}{1 + (n-1) \exp[-2(p, |t|)]} \, dt = \\
&= -\frac{2}{p_2(n-1)} \int_0^\infty dt_1 \int_0^\infty d \ln [1 + (n-1) e^{-2p_1 t_1} e^{-2p_2 t_2}] = \\
&= \frac{2}{p_2(n-1)} \int_0^\infty \ln [1 + (n-1) e^{-2p_1 t_1}] \, dt_1 = \frac{2}{p_2(n-1)} Q_n.
\end{aligned}$$

Let $x = (n-1) e^{-2p_1 t_1}$, then

$$Q_n = \frac{1}{2p_1} \int_0^{n-1} \frac{\ln(1+x)}{x} \, dx = \frac{1}{2p_1} \int_0^1 \frac{\ln(1+x)}{x} \, dx + \frac{1}{2p_1} \int_1^{n-1} \frac{\ln(1+x)}{x} \, dx.$$

Calculations of the two last integral give (see [5])

$$Q_n = \frac{\pi^2}{24p_1} + \frac{\ln^2(n-1)}{4p_1} + \frac{1}{2p_1} \cdot \psi(n),$$

where

$$\psi(n) = \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{(2k)^2 \cdot (n-1)^{2k}} - \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{(2k-1)^2 \cdot (n-1)^{2k-1}}.$$

It is easy to verify that

$$|\psi(n)| < \frac{1}{n-2}.$$

$$K_n = \frac{\ln^2(n-1)}{2p_1p_2(n-1)} + \frac{\pi^2}{12p_1p_2(n-1)} + O\left(\frac{1}{n^2}\right).$$

Therefore if $n \rightarrow \infty$, then

$$\frac{n}{\ln^2 n} \int_{R^2} \frac{|f_1(t)|^2}{1 + (n-1) \cdot |f_1(t)|^2} dt \rightarrow \frac{1}{2p_1p_2}.$$

Thus, from expression (2) with $s = 2$ the statement of the Theorem 1 follows.

Hence, Theorem 1 is proved.

3. ASYMPTOTIC BEHAVIOUR OF I_n

The estimator $\hat{p}_n(x)$ is said to be of an *exponential type* if

$$(3) \quad f_3(t) = h(A_n \cdot e^{x|t_1|}, A_n \cdot e^{x|t_2|}),$$

where

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n = 0, \quad |h(t)| \leq B, \quad h(t) \in L_2, \quad t \in R^2.$$

Let us consider the following condition:

$$(4) \quad |1 - h(t)| \leq B_1 |t_1 t_2| \quad \text{for all } |t_i| \leq 1, \quad i = 1, 2.$$

Theorem 2. Let $f_1(t)$ satisfy the condition (a), let the estimator $\hat{p}_n(x)$ be of an exponential type, let the function $h(t)$ satisfy (4) and let

$$A_n = D \cdot n^{-b}, \quad b > \frac{1}{2}, \quad \alpha \leq p_i \quad (i = 1, 2).$$

Then the estimator $\hat{p}_n(x)$ is integrally consistent of order $n/\ln^2 n$, namely:

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{n}{\ln^2 n} \cdot I_n = \left(\frac{b}{\pi \alpha} \right)^2.$$

First we formulate two lemmas.

Lemma 1. Under the conditions of Theorem 2 we have

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{\ln^2 n} \int_{Dn^{-b}}^{\infty} \int_{Dn^{-b}}^{\infty} \frac{h^2(t_1, t_2)}{t_1 \cdot t_2} dt_1 dt_2 = b^2.$$

Proof.

$$(5) \quad \begin{aligned} & \frac{1}{\ln^2 n} \int_{Dn^{-b}}^{\infty} \int_{Dn^{-b}}^{\infty} \frac{h^2(t_1, t_2)}{t_1 \cdot t_2} dt_1 dt_2 = \\ & = \frac{1}{\ln^2 n} \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 \frac{dt_1 dt_2}{t_1 \cdot t_2} - \frac{1}{\ln^2 n} \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 \frac{1 - h^2(t_1, t_2)}{t_1 \cdot t_2} dt_1 dt_2 + \\ & + \frac{1}{\ln^2 n} \int_1^{\infty} \int_1^{\infty} \frac{h^2(t_1, t_2)}{t_1 \cdot t_2} dt_1 dt_2 + \frac{1}{\ln^2 n} \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 \int_1^{\infty} \frac{h^2(t_1, t_2)}{t_1 \cdot t_2} dt_1 dt_2 + \\ & + \frac{1}{\ln^2 n} \int_1^{\infty} \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 \frac{h^2(t_1, t_2)}{t_1 \cdot t_2} dt_1 dt_2. \end{aligned}$$

The first term of (5) tends to b^2 if $n \rightarrow \infty$. It follows from conditions (4) and $h(t_1, t_2) \in L_2$, that the other terms of (5) tend to zero if $n \rightarrow \infty$.

Lemma 1 is proved.

Lemma 2. Under the conditions of Theorem 2 we have

$$\int_{R^2} |f_1(t)|^2 \cdot |1 - f_3(t)|^2 dt = o\left(\frac{\ln^2 n}{n}\right).$$

Proof.

$$\begin{aligned} & \frac{n}{\ln^2 n} \int_{R^2} |f_1(t)|^2 \cdot |1 - f_3(t)|^2 dt = \\ & = \frac{4n}{\ln^2 n} \int_0^{\infty} \int_0^{\infty} |f_1(t_1, t_2)|^2 \cdot |1 - f_3(t_1, t_2)|^2 dt_1 dt_2 = Q. \end{aligned}$$

Denote

$$x_1 = Dn^{-b} e^{\alpha t_1}, \quad x_2 = Dn^{-b} e^{\alpha t_2}.$$

Then we have

$$\begin{aligned} Q &= n \left(\frac{2}{\ln n} \right)^2 \int_{Dn^{-b}}^{\infty} \int_{Dn^{-b}}^{\infty} \left| f_1 \left[\frac{1}{\alpha} \ln \left(\frac{n^b}{D} x_1 \right), \frac{1}{\alpha} \ln \left(\frac{n^b}{D} x_2 \right) \right] \right|^2 \cdot \\ &\quad \cdot \frac{|1 - h(x_1, x_2)|^2}{\alpha^2 x_1 x_2} dx_1 dx_2 \leq n \left(\frac{2}{\ln n} \right)^2 \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 A^2 \cdot \\ &\quad \cdot \exp \left\{ -2 \left[\frac{p_1}{\alpha} \ln \left(\frac{x_1}{Dn^{-b}} \right) + \frac{p_2}{\alpha} \ln \left(\frac{x_2}{Dn^{-b}} \right) \right] \right\} B_1^2 \frac{x_1 x_2}{\alpha^2} dx_1 dx_2 + \\ &\quad + n \left(\frac{2}{\ln n} \right)^2 \int_1^{\infty} \int_1^{\infty} (1 + B)^2 A^2 \exp \left\{ -2 \left[\frac{p_1}{\alpha} \ln \left(\frac{x_1}{Dn^{-b}} \right) + \frac{p_2}{\alpha} \ln \left(\frac{x_2}{Dn^{-b}} \right) \right] \right\}. \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \cdot \frac{dx_1 dx_2}{\alpha^2 x_1 x_2} + n \left(\frac{2}{\ln n} \right)^2 \int_1^\infty \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 (1+B)^2 A^2 \exp \left\{ -2 \left[\frac{p_1}{\alpha} \ln \left(\frac{x_1}{Dn^{-b}} \right) + \right. \right. \\ & \left. \left. + \frac{p_2}{\alpha} \ln \left(\frac{x_2}{Dn^{-b}} \right) \right] \right\} \frac{dx_1 dx_2}{\alpha^2 x_1 x_2} + n \left(\frac{2}{\ln n} \right)^2 \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 \int_1^\infty (1+B)^2 A^2 \cdot \\ & \cdot \exp \left\{ -2 \left[\frac{p_1}{\alpha} \ln \left(\frac{x_1}{Dn^{-b}} \right) + \frac{p_2}{\alpha} \ln \left(\frac{x_2}{Dn^{-b}} \right) \right] \right\} \frac{dx_1 dx_2}{\alpha^2 x_1 x_2} = Q_1 + Q_2 + Q_3 + Q_4. \end{aligned}$$

Since $p_i \geq \alpha$, $2b > 1$ we have

$$\begin{aligned} Q_1 & \leq n \left(\frac{2}{\ln n} \right)^2 \frac{A^2 B_1^2}{\alpha^2} \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 \exp \left[-2 \ln \left(\frac{x_1}{Dn^{-b}} \right) \right] x_1 dx_1. \\ & \cdot \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 \exp \left[-2 \ln \left(\frac{x_2}{Dn^{-b}} \right) x_2 dx_2 = n \left(\frac{2}{\ln n} \right)^2 \frac{A^2 B_1^2}{\alpha^2} \frac{D^4}{n^{4b}} (b \ln n - \ln D)^2 \xrightarrow{n \rightarrow \infty} 0, \right. \\ Q_2 & \leq n \left(\frac{2}{\ln n} \right)^2 \frac{(1+B)^2 A^2}{\alpha^2} \int_1^\infty \exp \left[-2 \ln \left(\frac{x_1}{Dn^{-b}} \right) \right] dx_1. \\ & \cdot \int_1^\infty \exp \left[-2 \ln \left(\frac{x_2}{Dn^{-b}} \right) \right] dx_2 = n \left(\frac{2}{\ln n} \right)^2 \frac{(1+B)^2 A^2}{\alpha^2} \frac{D^4}{n^{4b}} \xrightarrow{n \rightarrow \infty} 0, \\ Q_3 & \leq n \left(\frac{2}{\ln n} \right)^2 \frac{(1+B)^2 A^2}{\alpha^2} \int_{Dn^{-b}}^1 \exp \left[-2 \ln \left(\frac{x_1}{Dn^{-b}} \right) \right] \frac{dx_1}{x_1}. \\ & \cdot \int_1^\infty \exp \left[-2 \ln \left(\frac{x_2}{Dn^{-b}} \right) \right] dx_2 = n \left(\frac{2}{\ln n} \right)^2 \frac{(1+B)^2 A^2}{2\alpha^2} \frac{D^4}{n^{4b}} \frac{(n^{2b} - 1)}{D^2} \xrightarrow{n \rightarrow \infty} 0. \end{aligned}$$

Also

$$Q_4 \xrightarrow{n \rightarrow \infty} 0.$$

Lemma 2 is proved.

Proof of Theorem 2. It follows from (1) that

$$\begin{aligned} n \left(\frac{2\pi}{\ln n} \right)^2 I_n & = \frac{1}{\ln^2 n} \int_{R^2} |f_3(t)|^2 [1 - |f_1(t)|^2]^2 dt + \frac{n}{\ln^2 n} \int_{R^2} |f_1(t)|^2 |1 - f_3(t)|^2 dt = \\ & = \frac{1}{\ln^2 n} \int_{R^2} h^2(Dn^{-b} e^{\alpha|t_1|}, Dn^{-b} e^{\alpha|t_2|}) dt - \frac{1}{\ln^2 n} \int_{R^2} h^2(Dn^{-b} e^{\alpha|t_1|}, Dn^{-b} e^{\alpha|t_2|}). \\ & \cdot |f_1(t)|^2 dt + \frac{n}{\ln^2 n} \int_{R^2} |f_1(t)|^2 |1 - f_3(t)|^2 dt. \end{aligned}$$

The first term of the last expression tends to $(2b/\alpha)^2$ if $n \rightarrow \infty$ according to Lemma 1.

The second term tends to zero since $|h(t)| \leq B$ for all (t_1, t_2) .

The third term tends also to zero according to Lemma 2.

Thus

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{n}{\ln^2 n} I_n = \left(\frac{b}{\pi \alpha} \right)^2.$$

Hence Theorem 2 is proved.

4. EXAMPLES

The following examples show that the order of consistency of an estimator can be reached.

Example 1. Let us consider the probability density of the form

$$p(x, y) = \frac{1}{\pi^2(1+x^2)(1+y^2)}.$$

Obviously,

$$f(t_1, t_2) = e^{-|t_1|-|t_2|}.$$

Then

$$\begin{aligned} p_n^*(0, 0) &= \frac{4n}{(2\pi)^2} \int_0^\infty \int_0^\infty \frac{\exp[-2t_1 - 2t_2]}{1 + (n-1)\exp[-2t_1 - 2t_2]} dt_1 dt_2 = \\ &= \frac{n \ln^2(n-1)}{8\pi^2(n-1)} + \frac{n}{48(n-1)} + O\left(\frac{1}{n}\right). \end{aligned}$$

Thus if $n \rightarrow \infty$

$$I_n^* = \frac{1}{8\pi^2} \frac{\ln^2 n}{n} + \frac{1}{48} \frac{1}{n} + O\left(\frac{1}{n^2}\right).$$

Example 2. Now, we also consider the density of Cauchy distribution

$$p(x, y) = \frac{1}{(2\pi)^2} \frac{1}{(1+x^2+y^2)^{3/2}}.$$

In this case

$$f(t_1, t_2) = \frac{1}{(2\pi)^2} \int_{R^2} \exp[i(t_1 x + t_2 y)] p(x, y) dx dy = \exp[-\sqrt{(t_1^2 + t_2^2)}],$$

and

$$p_n^*(0, 0) = \frac{4n}{(2\pi)^2} \int_0^\infty \int_0^\infty \frac{\exp[-2\sqrt{(t_1^2 + t_2^2)}]}{1 + (n-1)\exp[-2\sqrt{(t_1^2 + t_2^2)}]} dt_1 dt_2.$$

250 Using the polar coordinates $t_1 = \varrho \cos \theta$, $t_2 = \varrho \sin \theta$ we have

$$p_n^*(0, 0) = \frac{n}{4\pi(n-1)} \left[\frac{\pi^2}{24} + \frac{\ln^2(n-1)}{4} + O\left(\frac{1}{n}\right) \right].$$

Hence

$$I_n^* = \frac{1}{16\pi} \frac{\ln^2 n}{n} + \frac{\pi}{96} \frac{1}{n} + O\left(\frac{1}{n^2}\right).$$

Example 3. At last we consider an example where the characteristic function decreases more rapidly than a characteristic function with properties (a), (b). Denote the density of the bivariate normal distribution by $p(x, y)$, i.e.

$$p(x, y) = \frac{1}{2\pi\sqrt{(1-r^2)}} \exp\left\{-\frac{1}{2(1-r^2)} [x^2 - 2rxy + y^2]\right\}, \quad r^2 \neq 1.$$

Obviously

$$f(t_1, t_2) = \exp\{-\frac{1}{2}[t_1^2 + 2rt_1t_2 + t_2^2]\}.$$

Then

$$\begin{aligned} p_n^*(0, 0) &= \frac{4n}{(2\pi)^2} \int_0^\infty \int_0^\infty \frac{|f(t_1, t_2)|^2}{1 + (n-1)|f(t_1, t_2)|^2} dt_1 dt_2 = \\ &= \frac{n}{\pi^2} \int_0^{\pi/2} d\theta \int_0^\infty \frac{\varrho \exp[-(\varrho^2 + r\varrho^2 \sin 2\theta)]}{1 + (n-1) \exp[-(\varrho^2 + r\varrho^2 \sin 2\theta)]} d\varrho. \end{aligned}$$

Thus (see [5])

$$I_n^* = \frac{1}{2\pi^2\sqrt{(1-r^2)}} \left[\frac{\pi}{2} - \arctg \frac{r}{\sqrt{(1-r^2)}} \right] \frac{\ln n}{n} + O\left(\frac{1}{n}\right).$$

The example 3 shows that the order of consistency of the estimator is the best possible in this case.

(Received February 21, 1972.)

REFERENCES

- [1] I. Vaduva: Contributii la teoria estimatiilor statistice ale densitatilor de repartie și aplicatii. Studii si cercetari Matematice 20 (1968), 8, 1207–1276.
- [2] M. A. Мирзахмедов: Об оценке многомерной плотности вероятности (On the estimation of a multivariate probability density). In: Научные труды Ташкентского государственного университета. Ташкент 1969, 146–150.
- [3] G. S. Watson, M. R. Leadbetter: On the estimation of the probability density I. Annals of Mathematical Statistics 34 (1963), 2, 480–491.
- [4] E. Parzen: On asymptotically efficient consistent estimates of the spectral density of a stationary time series. Journal Royal Statist. Soc. Ser. B 20 (1958), 2, 303–322.
- [5] G. B. Dvight: Tables of integrals and other mathematical data. New York 1961.

M. A. Mirzachmedov, Sh. A. Chashimov: Chair of Probability Theory and Mathematical Statistics of Tashkent State University, Tashkent, USSR.